### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries



Antoine Watteau French, 1684 - 1721

# The Italian Comedians

probably 1720

oil on canvas

overall:  $63.8 \times 76.2$  cm (25 1/8  $\times$  30 in.)

framed: 94.62 × 107 × 13.65 cm (37 1/4 × 42 1/8 × 5 3/8 in.)

Samuel H. Kress Collection 1946.7.9

## **ENTRY**

Numerous paintings with figures in theatrical costume attest to Jean Antoine Watteau's interest in the theater. In *The Italian Comedians*, however—as in others of his works in this genre—the identity of some of the characters remains uncertain or equivocal because he sometimes reused the same model for different figures and modified standard costumes according to his whim. Pierre Rosenberg has drawn attention to the announcement in the *Mercure de France* of the 1733 print after *The Italian Comedians* [fig. 1] by Bernard Baron (1696–1762): "These are almost all portraits of men skilled in their art, whom Watteau painted in the different clothing of the actors of the Italian Theatre." [1] It would seem, then, that the painting does not record an actual performance; and we lack evidence as to who these individuals might actually be. It was Baron's print (included in the *Recueil Jullienne*, the compendium of prints after Watteau's work) that gave *The Italian Comedians* its title.

The scene appears to represent a curtain call of the Comédie Italienne, the French version of the commedia dell'arte, which presented stock characters in predictably humorous plots. A red curtain has been drawn aside from a stage where fifteen figures stand together. At the center is Pierrot, standing resplendent in a white

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

costume and gazing out with an ambiguous expression. He is positioned directly in front of a doorway in the stone wall forming the back of the stage; visible just beyond are trees and sky. The figure raising the curtain at the extreme right has been tentatively identified as Scapin; [2] the hunched old man at right as the Doctor (or possibly Pantaloon); [3] and the figure gesturing to Pierrot as Brighella (or perhaps Scaramouche). [4] The guitarist is unidentified, but behind him may be Mezzetin, who flirts with an unidentified character (perhaps Sylvia). [5] The tall woman standing just to the right of Pierrot might be Flaminia, Sylvia, or perhaps "not...any particular stock character;" [6] beside her are an unidentified man and woman. Probably the only figures whose identities are unanimously agreed upon are Harlequin, recognizable by his mask and diamond-patterned costume, and of course the centrally placed Pierrot.

Pierrot was a fixture in the performances of the Comédie Italienne from the early 1680s until 1697, when the company offended Louis XIV with a play titled La Fausse Prude, thought to be a satire of Madame de Maintenon. The king banished the players from France, an event that Watteau memorialized (though he did not witness it, arriving in Paris three years after the fact) in a lost work, The Departure of the Italian Comedians in 1697 [fig. 2]. [7] Here, Pierrot in his baggy white costume is seen in supplication. After the king's death the climate was right for reviving the troupe, which by then was seen as an unfortunate casualty of Madame de Maintenon's excessive control at Versailles. The regent Philippe d'Orléans arranged with the Prince of Parma, Antonio Farnese, for the return of the comedians in 1716; they performed at the Palais-Royal until the reopening of their old theatre at the Hôtel de Bourgogne. [8] The troupe that was invited back after the nineteen-year hiatus, however, "had nothing in common with the old Comédie-Italienne," according to François Moureau. [9]

On the assumption that The Italian Comedians was an early misnomer that had given rise to a long but erroneous interpretive tradition, Albert Pomme de Mirimonde set forth the hypothesis that the painting might represent a rival company, the Opéra-Comique. Established under that name in 1715, the Opéra-Comique was an itinerant and less formal company that had worked the popular theaters of the fairs around Paris, notably the Foire Saint-Laurent and the Foire Saint-Germain. [10] It seems that some of these characters, notably Pierrot, appeared with some transmutability in the Comédie Italienne, the Opéra-Comique, and other itinerant groups of players who constituted the various fair theaters. Watteau favored the Opéra-Comique over the more official French and Italian

### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

comedians. However, under pressure from the French and Italian factions, the regent forced the Opéra-Comique to disband in 1719; some players went to London, where Watteau was then staying. Under this scenario, Watteau painted the work as a final tribute to a moribund troupe, just as Pierrot is shown giving the last farewell. Watteau could not know that the ban was only temporary and that his death would precede the Opéra-Comique's triumphal reinstatement by a mere three days. [11] Mirimonde suggests that his interpretation avoids two major pitfalls of the more traditional one: Why would Watteau have chosen to celebrate the Italian comedians at a time when members of his preferred Opéra-Comique were visiting, and if he did so, why would he have put at the center of the composition Pierrot, who was the very personification of the Opéra-Comique? Despite their apparently related titles, the painting is not a pendant to *The French Comedians* of 1720–1721 (New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art), which has often been read as a satire of their theater's more pompous airs. [12] In any case, the dimensions and the relative scale of the figures in these two paintings are different. [13]

Dora Panofsky proposed that Watteau invests Pierrot "with a prominence and significance not justified by his actual importance on the stage" for the purpose of his "isolation and glorification." [14] Indeed, in The Italian Comedians he stands both apart from and above the rest, presiding with apparent irony. Watteau's strategy of awarding Pierrot an elevated status while underscoring his melancholy detachment has encouraged speculation about the artist's own identification with this minor character. [15] Panofsky ventured to link Watteau's The Italian Comedians with several of Rembrandt's religious etchings that use similar figural groupings. [16] But her bold conclusion—that Scaramouche/Brighella's gesture is an intentional reference to that of Pilate and that the pure, white-clad Pierrot with a halo-like glow around his head is in turn a secular version of Christ presented to the people — has not found general acceptance. [17] Pierrot's costume matches that of his double, the so-called "Gilles" (but now generally recognized as Pierrot) [18] in the famous painting of that same name in the Musée du Louvre. The identity and significance of the Pierrot figure in these paintings is doubtless the key to their true meaning, but so far it remains elusive.

Eighteenth-century sources refer to *The Italian Comedians* as one of two works dating from Watteau's yearlong stay in London shortly before his death. Suffering from tuberculosis, he had come to the city in 1719 to consult Dr. Richard Mead, the celebrated physician, art collector, and Francophile. One of the works that Watteau painted for Dr. Mead was *Peaceful Love* [fig. 3]; the other was "A company of

3

### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

Italian Comedians by the same [artist] and of the same size. Watteau being in England and not in the best of health or financial circumstances, Dr. Mead likely relieved him in both and employed him in painting these two pictures, which are engraved by Baron." [19] The announcement for Baron's engraving indicated that the painting on which it was based was "in the cabinet of Mr. Mead, physician to the king of Great Britain. He commissioned it from Watteau during the latter's sojourn in London." [20] Robin Simons points out that, during the period, at least two French commedia dell'arte troupes were performing in London: the companies of Jean-Baptist Grimberghs and of Francisque Moylin. Watteau's scene, therefore, may depict neither the Comédie Italienne nor the Opéra Comique at all, but rather a performance that the artist saw in London. [21]

Craig Hanson has proposed that *The Italian Comedians* alludes to a pamphlet war in London in 1718 and 1719 between Mead and his supporters and Dr. John Woodward concerning in particular their respective treatments for smallpox. [22] In this reading, the hunched and wizened Doctor at the right of the composition stands in for Woodward, whose quackish notions have been exposed by the character of Pierrot and are ridiculed in a dialogue between Scaramouche and Harlequin in a satirical stage production. Ingenious as this reading may be, we are not persuaded that the evidence is sufficient to identify Scaramouche, Harlequin, and Pierrot (a surrogate for Mead?) as representing the triumphant triumvirate of the Mead camp versus the embittered Doctor "Woodward," cringing at stage left. Watteau's *The Italian Comedians* still keeps its secret.

Did Watteau paint the National Gallery's picture? [23] We believe he did, but this authorship has been questioned. For example, Colin Eisler speculated that it might be a work completed by the artist Philippe Mercier or else "an excellent, very early copy." [24] Donald Posner wrote categorically, "The original painting has unfortunately disappeared, but a fine old copy in the National Gallery in Washington is some compensation for the loss." [25] Baron's engraving is faithful in composition, although in places the print is worked out in more detail, as Eisler has noted. [26] In many respects it is more generously proportioned: from the roundness of the jester/puppeteer's head and features to the thickness of the Doctor's walking stick or the guitarist's fingers. Details such as hands are more exactly rendered in the print, while the sleeve of Harlequin's raised arm has a scintillating, crinkled texture somewhat lacking in the painting. The roses in the print appear more luxuriant. Other differences in the print are the vertical foliage in Flaminia's bodice and the straight-falling bangs of the child in the corner. But these

4

### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

differences may be ascribed to the engraver's personal style and/or to later losses to the original painting. The dimensions noted by Baron are slightly larger than the present painting, but the canvas may have been trimmed. [27]

The painting may have been in better condition when Gustav Friedrich Waagen described it in 1857 as "of such vivacity in the heads, clearness of colouring, and carefulness of execution, that I do not hesitate to pronounce it one of the most remarkable works of the master I know." [28] The work we see today is somewhat marred by losses, abrasion, and flattened impasto, perhaps due to previous restorations. Once the discolored varnish and overpaint were removed in 1984, an extensive bright red underdrawing typical of Watteau emerged, applied with a brush. Moreover, the original technique was consistent with Watteau's reputation as a technically sloppy artist: brush hairs were found in the paint, and it appeared that some colors had run together on his disorderly palette (see [fig. 4], the stripped-down canvas before inpainting). [29]

Watteau must have worked out this dense composition with some care: four surviving drawings can be related to the disposition of the different characters, culminating in [fig. 5] (although it is not yet a final version), where the backdrop suggests an outdoor urban setting. [30] At least nine studies exist, which Watteau employed for the poses or details of individual figures: for the guitarist; [31] Harlequin; [32] the young actress at left; [33] her beau Mezzetin [fig. 6]; [34] the young man raising the curtain [fig. 7]; [35] the old doctor; [36] the actress standing next to Pierrot; [37] the child at lower left; [38] and Brighella. [39] It remains an open question how far any of these drawings was made with *The Italian Comedians* in mind, or whether Watteau combined them into the painting from his large repertoire of existing graphic observations.

This text was previously published in Philip Conisbee et al., *French Paintings of the Fifteenth through the Eighteenth Century*, The Collections of the National Gallery of Art Systematic Catalogue (Washington, DC, 2009), 472–479.

Original entry by Philip Conisbee. Revised by Aaron Wile to clarify the identification of several figures.

Aaron Wile, Philip Conisbee

May 13, 2022

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

## **COMPARATIVE FIGURES**



fig. 1 Bernard Baron after Jean Antoine Watteau, The Italian Comedians, in L'oeuvre d'Antoine Watteau (volume II), c. 1740, engraving, National Gallery of Art, Washington, Widener Collection, 1942.9.2093



fig. 2 Louis Jacob after Jean Antoine Watteau, The Departure of the Italian Comedians in 1697, in L'oeuvre d'Antoine Watteau (volume II), c. 1740, engraving, National Gallery of Art, Washington, Widener Collection, 1942.9.2093

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries



fig. 3 Bernard Baron after Jean Antoine Watteau, Peaceful Love, in L'oeuvre d'Antoine Watteau (volume II), c. 1740, engraving, National Gallery of Art, Washington, Widener Collection, 1942.9.2093



fig. 4 Cleaned state, before restoration, Antoine Watteau, The Italian Comedians, probably 1720, oil on canvas, National Gallery of Art, Washington, Samuel H. Kress Collection, 1946.7.9

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries



fig. 5 Antoine Watteau, Italian Comedians Taking Their Bows, c. 1718, red chalk and graphite on cream laid paper, National Gallery of Art, Washington, Gift of Gertrude Laughlin Chanler, 2000.9.27



fig. 6 Antoine Watteau, An Actor, c. 1719, red chalk, Minneapolis Institute of Art, The John R. Van Derlip Fund 69.88. Photo: Minneapolis Institute of Art



fig. 7 Antoine Watteau, Man Raising a Curtain, c. 1719, red chalk, British Museum, London. © The Trustees of the British Museum

### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

#### **NOTES**

- [1] Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721
   (Washington, DC, 1984), 442, citing the Mercure de France, March 1733, 554:
   "Ce sont presque tous portraits de gens habiles dans leur art que Watteau peignit sous les différens habits des acteurs du Théâtre Italien."
- [2] Colin Eisler, *Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian* (Oxford, 1977), 300.
- [3] Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 515; Colin Eisler, Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian (Oxford, 1977), 300.
- [4] For various identifications of these figures, see Dora Panofsky, "Gilles or Pierrot? Iconographic Notes on Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 39 (May 1952): 335; Martin Eidelberg, "Les Comédiens italiens," A Watteau Abecedario, February 2022, http://watteau-abecedario.org/Comediens\_italiens.htm; Colin Eisler, Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian (Oxford, 1977), 300; Gaston Schéfer, "Le portrait dans l'oeuvre de Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 3, 16 (1896): 187.
- [5] Dora Panofsky, "Gilles or Pierrot? Iconographic Notes on Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 39 (May 1952): 337; Colin Eisler, Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian (Oxford, 1977), 301; Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 510, which identifies the flirting male figure as Brighella. George T. M. Shackelford, "The Italian Comedians," in A Gift to America: Masterpieces of European Painting from the Samuel H. Kress Collection (New York, 1994), 210, corrects the identification of Mezzetin in Grasselli and Rosenberg.
- [6] See, respectively, Dora Panofsky, "Gilles or Pierrot? Iconographic Notes on Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 39 (May 1952): 335; Colin Eisler, Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian (Oxford, 1977), 300; Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 516.
- [7] On *The Departure of the Italian Comedians in 1697*, see, most recently, Julie Anne Plax, *Watteau and the Cultural Politics of Eighteenth-Century France* Cambridge, 2000), 7–52.
- [8] Information on the theater comes from Colin Eisler, *Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian* (Oxford, 1977), 301–302; Hélène Adhémar and René Huyghe, *Watteau: Sa vie, son*

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

- oeuvre (Paris, 1950), 100; Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, *Watteau 1684–1721* (Washington, DC, 1984), 490–491.
- [9] Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 490. Headed by Luigi Riccoboni, the post-1716 troupe had eleven roles: two pairs of lovers (Lelio, Mario, Flaminia, and Sylvia); two old men (Pantaloon and the "Doctor"); two schemers (Scaramouche and Scapin); a valet-buffoon (Harlequin); and a singer and a maidservant. Pierrot was introduced as a character from the itinerant Théâtre de la Foire.
- [10] Albert Pomme de Mirimonde, "Les sujets musicaux chez Antoine Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 58 (Nov. 1961): 271–274; on the fairs, see Thomas E. Crow, Painters and Public Life in Eighteenth-Century Paris (New Haven and London, 1985), 44–53.
- [11] July 18 and 21, 1721, respectively. See Albert Pomme de Mirimonde, "Les sujets musicaux chez Antoine Watteau," *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* ser. 6, 58 (Nov. 1961): 272–274, for the War of the Theatres.
- [12] See Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, *Watteau 1684–1721* (Washington, DC, 1984), 438–439.
- [13] As discussed by Rosenberg in Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, *Watteau 1684–1721* (Washington, DC, 1984), 440.
- [14] Dora Panofsky, "Gilles or Pierrot? Iconographic Notes on Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 39 (May 1952): 331, 337. See Albert Pomme de Mirimonde, "Les sujets musicaux chez Antoine Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 58 (Nov. 1961): 271, on the tradition in eighteenth-century vaudeville of Pierrot, "personnage préféré des spectateurs," delivering the final couplet. See also Donald Posner, Antoine Watteau (Ithaca, 1984), 265, on this topic, and Colin Eisler, Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian (Oxford, 1977), 302, on the consequences for nineteenth-century notions of Pierrot/Gilles of his inflated importance in The Italian Comedians.
- [15] Dora Panofsky, "Gilles or Pierrot? Iconographic Notes on Watteau," *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* ser. 6, 39 (May 1952): 332.
- [16] Watteau would have known Rembrandt's works well, not least because his friend Edme Gersaint, the Parisian art dealer and collector, was a Rembrandt connoisseur who published a catalogue raisonné of his prints.
- [17] Dora Panofsky, "Gilles or Pierrot? Iconographic Notes on Watteau," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 39 (May 1952): 339. Rosenberg, in Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 441, characterized the formal resemblance as "undoubtedly fortuitous"; Donald Posner, Antoine Watteau (Ithaca, 1984), 265, showed that Pierrot's central, frontal position was not an a priori choice but instead evolved over

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

- three preparatory drawings.
- [18] Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, *Watteau 1684–1721* (Washington, DC, 1984), 433.
- [19] Richard Mead, A Catalogue of Pictures Consisting of Portraits, Landscapes, Sea-Pieces, Architecture, Flowers, Fruits, Animals, Histories of the Late Richard Mead M.D., Sold by Auction in March 1754 (London, 1755).

  However, according to the legend on Baron's engraving of Peaceful Love, it was the same size as the engraving (33.5 × 40.1 cm), so therefore smaller than The Italian Comedians. George Vertue, writing in 1725, referred to "two pictures painted by...Watteaux. Conversations, painted in England," in George Vertue, "The Notebooks of George Vertue-III," Walpole Society 22 (1933–1934): 23.
- [20] Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 440, citing the Mercure de France, March 1733, 554, "dans le Cabinet de M. Mead, Medecin du Roy de la Grande–Bretagne. Il le fit faire à Watteau dans le voyage qu'il fit à Londres."
- [21] Robin Simons, *Hogarth, France, and British Art: The Rise of the Arts in 18th-Century Britain* (Cornwall, 2007), 71.
- [22] Craig Hanson, "Dr. Richard Mead and Watteau's 'Comédiens Italiens," *Burlington Magazine* 145 (Apr. 2003): 265–272.
- [23] For a long time no other full-size version of the painting was known. In 1890 the so-called Groult version appeared and was enthusiastically hailed as the original: "incomparably brilliant, executed with superb assurance" (Virgile Josz, Watteau: moeurs du XVIIIe siècle, 2nd ed. [Paris, 1903], 430); "a Watteau of premier importance" (Paul Mantz, "Watteau, VI," Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 3, 3 [1890]: 225). The bibliography in Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 443, lists separately the references to the Groult copy, all of which transfer to it the early history of the National Gallery's painting. The painting that Georges Wildenstein presented as the Groult version to the National Gallery in 1960 does not merit such praise and can only be a copy; see The Italian Comedians (copy). Correspondence in the NGA curatorial files suggests that the Groult painting may still be at large. Other related works include a reduced version once reported in the collection of Ries and a tapestry in the Lehmann collection (Colin Eisler, Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian [Oxford, 1977], 301, and Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 [Washington, DC, 1984], 443).
- [24] Colin Eisler, *Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian* (Oxford, 1977), 303.
- [25] Donald Posner, Antoine Watteau (Ithaca, 1984), 263.

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

- [26] Colin Eisler, *Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian* (Oxford, 1977), 303.
- [27] Rosenberg, in Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, Watteau 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 443, suggests that Baron made a measurement error.
- [28] Gustav Friedrich Waagen, Galleries and Cabinets of Art in Great Britain, vol. 4 and supplement to Treasures of Art in Great Britain (London, 1857), 96–97.
- [29] See the Technical Notes and the full discussion by Sarah Fisher of her treatment of the picture in Margaret Morgan Grasselli and Pierre Rosenberg, *Watteau* 1684–1721 (Washington, DC, 1984), 465–467.
- [30] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 1: no. 179, verso; 2: nos. 552, 621, 622.
- [31] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, 1684–1721: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 1: no. 219.
- [32] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 481.
- [33] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 519.
- [34] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 623.
- [35] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 507, verso.
- [36] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, 1684–1721: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 624, counterproof.
- [37] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 647.
- [38] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 649.
- [39] Pierre Rosenberg and Antoine Prat, *Antoine Watteau*, *1684–1721*: catalogue raisonné des dessins (Paris and Milan, 1996), 2: no. 651.

### **TECHNICAL SUMMARY**

The original support is a fine, somewhat tightly woven, plain-weave fabric. Its tacking margins have been cropped, and the painting has been lined. The current

### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

stretcher is slightly larger than the original fabric, extending the painting by 0.3 cm on all four sides. Moderately pronounced cusping is present along the top and bottom edges of the fabric but not along the vertical edges. The yellowish, off-white ground is a smooth layer of medium thickness. Over the ground is a very fluid, finely brushed red underdrawing, which outlines the forms and indicates the major drapery folds and the facial features. In some areas the artist may have deliberately left this underdrawing visible; in other areas the overlying paint appears to have "pearled up" over it, as a lean layer over a fatter layer; in still other areas, abrasion has made the underdrawing visible. There are a few minor contour changes from the underdrawing to the painted design, in all cases the painted version being narrower or smaller than the drawn version. The most notable changes are in the upper edge of Pierrot's hat and the bent arm of Harlequin.

The paint was applied fluidly with low impasto in the highlights. The yellowish ground serves as a warm middle tone, with lights scumbled and built up opaquely and darks, in many cases, glazed thinly over it. Glazes are used extensively. Thin scumbles of gray over the yellowish ground often become opalescent, serving as a transition between white and flesh-colored forms. Warm, vermilion-toned strokes are often used to highlight contours in the hands and faces. Characteristic of Watteau, there are brush hairs and lumps of different colored paint in the original paint layers.

The painting is in good condition, but the impasto has been flattened, and a fine fabric texture pattern has been imprinted into the upper paint layers, most likely during a past lining procedure. There are three tears in the fabric; a 7.5 cm horizontal one in the top right corner, a 2.5 cm vertical tear in the hip of the crouching jester at the bottom left, and a 12.7 cm irregularly shaped one through the proper right sleeve of the central figure. The paint layer suffers from moderate abrasion in the red drapery and the gray of the steps below the Fool at left; below Dr. Baloardo at right; in Pierrot's trousers; and in the thinly applied transition tones between the contours of figures and the background. There are scattered minor losses in the paint and ground layers, and a narrow, 16 cm-long, vertical loss extends down from the foliage to the left of Pierrot's proper right shoulder to his proper right hand. Characteristic traction crackle is present in the thin dark browns of the shadows and in Pierrot's hat. The painting was treated in 1984, when a discolored varnish was removed, losses were inpainted, and a clear varnish was applied. Prior to that, it had been relined and restored by Stephen Pichetto in 1943. [1] Neither the varnish nor the inpainting applied in 1984 has discolored.

### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

#### **TECHNICAL NOTES**

[1] During this most recent treatment, the NGA scientific research department used x-ray fluorescence spectroscopy to analyze the pigments, February 14, 1984.

## **PROVENANCE**

Possibly commissioned by Dr. Richard Mead [1673-1754], London; (his estate sale, Langford, London, 20-22 March 1754, 3rd day, no. 43, paired with no. 42, A Pastoral Conversation); Alderman William Beckford [1709-1770], London and Fonthill, Wiltshire, or his brother, Richard Beckford [d. 1756], London.[1] Roger Harenc [d. 1763], London;[2] (his estate sale, Langford, London, 1-3 March 1764, 3rd day, no. 52, a pair with A Musical Conversation [each day's lots begin with no. 1]); Augustus Henry, 3rd duke of Grafton [1735-1811], Euston Hall and London. acquired between 1851 and 1856 by Thomas Baring [1799-1873];[3] by inheritance to his nephew, Thomas George Baring, 1st earl of Northbrook [1826-1904], London; (Asher Wertheimer, London); purchased June 1888 by (Thos. Agnew and Sons, Ltd., London); sold the same month to Sir Edward Cecil Guinness [later 1st earl of Iveagh, 1847-1927], Dublin, London, Cowes, and Elveden Hall, Suffolk;[4] by inheritance to his third son, Walter Edward Guinness, 1st baron Moyne [1880-1944], London; purchased 18 February 1930 by (Wildenstein & Co., Inc., Paris, New York, and London).[5] Baron Heinrich Thyssen-Bornemisza [1875-1947], Schloss Rohoncz, Rechnitz, Hungary, and Amsterdam, by July 1930.[6] (Wildenstein & Co., Inc., Paris, New York, and London), by December 1936; purchased 23 November 1942 by the Samuel H. Kress Foundation, New York;[7] gift 1946 to NGA.

[1] See Robert Raines, "Watteau and 'Watteaus' in England before 1760," *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* 51 (February 1977): 62, for a discussion of which Beckford might have purchased the painting. William was his brother Richard's heir, and although William always resided in England, Richard lived mostly on the family's plantations in Jamaica. He only lived in London from late 1754 until late the next year, and he died in France early in 1756. If Richard owned the painting, it might possibly have been part of the "useful and ornamental furnishings" of his London house that were

### NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

sold by his executors in April 1756 to Sir James Colebrooke, whose name is sometimes included in the provenance. See F.H.W. Sheppard, *Survey of London*, vol. 33, *The Parish of St. Anne Soho*, London, 1966: 89, for details about ownership of the house by Beckford and subsequent purchasers.

- [2] Sometimes spelled "Harene." The title page of the 1764 sale catalogue clearly spells the name with a final "c." If this is the same Roger Harenc whose daughter, Susanna Mary Harenc, married Sir Archibald Edmonstone, 1st baronet Edmonstone, Harenc appears to have been born in Paris, came to England in the early 1720s, married an Englishwoman, and prospered in business. He is recorded as the buyer of Watteau paintings in sales in England in the 1740s and 1750s.
- [3] Gustav Friedrich Waagen, Galleries and Cabinets of Art in Great Britain: Being an Account of More than Forty Collections of Paintings, Drawings, Sculptures, Mss., etc. etc. visited in 1854 and 1956, and now for the first time described, London, 1957: 96-97, records additions to the Baring collection since his visit in 1851.
- [4] See Richard Kingzett of Agnew, letter to Colin Eisler, 21 November 1968, NGA curatorial files: "[W]e bought the picture from the famous dealer, Wertheimer, in 1888 and sold it to Lord Iveagh in the same year. No provenance is given in our entry for the picture." Later references identify the Wertheimer as Asher, rather than his brother Charles, who was also an art dealer. The date of the Agnew sale to Lord Iveagh is in Julius Bryant, *Kenwood: Paintings in the Iveagh Bequest*, New Haven and London, 2003: 416. The Thos. Agnew & Sons Ltd. Archive was acquired in 2014 by the National Gallery Archive, London, and the picture stock books have since been digitized and made available on-line. The Watteau is recorded on page 90 of the stock book for 1885-1891 (reference number NGA27/1/1/7); copy in NGA curatorial files.
- [5] This information is in Wildenstein records, and was kindly shared with the NGA by Ay-Whang Hsia of Wildenstein via a copy of her 5 November 2008 e-mail to Katharine Baetjer (copy in NGA curatorial files).

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

Colin Eisler (Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian, Oxford, 1977: 304 and n. 48), on the basis of a remark in René Gimpel, Journal d'un collectionneur, marchand de tableaux, Paris, 1963: 275, assumed the painting was with Wildenstein in 1924. However, this was discounted by Joseph Baillio of Wildenstein, who instead interpreted the remark to indicate that Nathan Wildenstein was simply asking Gimpel for his help in acquiring the painting (see A Gift to America: Masterpieces of European Painting from the Samuel H. Kress Collection, Exh. cat. North Carolina Museum of Art; The Museum of Fine Arts, Houston; The Seattle Art Museum; Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco; New York, 1994: 210 n. 3). The provenance supplied by Wildenstein to the Kress Foundation in 1942 (NGA curatorial files) incorrectly lists Walter Guinness and Lord Moyne as separate individuals and places the Thyssen-Bornemisza ownership between them, but it does not indicate the company had the painting more than once.

[6] The painting was in an exhibition of the Thyssen-Bornemisza collection that opened in July 1930. However, Wildenstein has no record of exactly when between February and July 1930 ownership of the painting changed hands (see Ay-Whang Hsia's e-mail of 5 November 2008; copy in NGA curatorial files).

[7] Wildenstein records provide the date by which the painting was with their New York office, and the sale date to the Kress Foundation (see Ay-Whang Hsia's e-mail of 5 November 2008; copy in NGA curatorial files). See also The Kress Collection Digital Archive, https://kress.nga.gov/Detail/objects/1130.

### **EXHIBITION HISTORY**

1871 Exhibition of Works by the Old Masters. Winter Exhibition, Royal Academy of Arts, London, 1871, no. 176, as Pierrot: a group.

1902 Selection of Works by French and English Painters of the Eighteenth Century, Art Gallery of the Corporation of London, 1902, no. 40.

1930 Loan for display with permanent collection, Alte Pinakothek, Munich, 1930-1931.

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

1930 Sammlung Schloss Rohoncz, Neue Pinakothek, Munich, 1930, no. 348.

1932 Exhibition of French Art 1200-1900, Royal Academy of Arts, London, 1932, no. 177, repro.

1946 Recent Additions to the Kress Collection, National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C., 1946, no. 774.

1980 Picasso: The Saltimbanques, National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C., 1980, no. 1, fig. 1.

1984 Watteau 1684-1721, National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.; Galeries nationales du Grand Palais, Paris; Schloss Charlottenburg, Berlin, West Germany, 1984-1985, no. 71.

1992 From El Greco to Cézanne: Masterpieces of European Painting from the National Gallery of Art, Washington, and The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, National Gallery of Greece, Athens, 1992-1993, no. 26, repro.

1994 A Gift to America: Masterpieces of European Painting from the Samuel H. Kress Collection, North Carolina Museum of Art, Raleigh; Museum of Fine Arts, Houston; Seattle Art Museum; Calif. Palace of the Legion of Honor, San Francisco, 1994-1995, no. 36.

2004 The Great Parade: Portrait of the Artist as Clown, Musée du Grand Palais, Paris; National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa, 2004, no. 1, repro.

2018 Rococo Rivals and Revivals, Timken Museum of Art, San Diego, 2018-2019, no catalogue.

### **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

- 1733 Mercure de France (March 1733): 554.
- 1857 Waagen, Gustav Friedrich. Galleries and Cabinets of Art in Great Britain: Being an Account of more than Forty Collections of Paintings, Drawings, Sculptures, Mss., &c.&c., visited in 1854 and 1856, ..., forming a supplemental volume to the "Treasures of Art in Great Britain." London, 1857: 4: 96-97.
- 1875 Goncourt, Edmond de. Catalogue raisonné de l'oeuvre peint, dessiné et gravé d'Antoine Watteau. Paris, 1875: 66, 67, no. 68.
- 1876 Walpole, Horace. Anecdotes of Painting in England... [1762-1771]. 4 vols.

# **NATIONAL GALLERY OF ART ONLINE EDITIONS**French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

	Rev. ed. London, 1876: 2:295.
1902	Staley, John Edgcumbe. Watteau and His School. London, 1902: 68, 147.
1929	Vertue, Goerge. "The Note Books of George Vertue Relating to Artists and Collections in England." <i>Walpole Society</i> 22 (1933-1934): 23.
1932	Wildenstein, Georges. "L'Exposition de l'art français a Londres: Le XVIIIe siècle." <i>Gazette des Beaux-Arts</i> , 6th ser., 7 (1932): repro.
1944	Cairns, Huntington, and John Walker, eds. <i>Masterpieces of Painting</i> from the National Gallery of Art. New York, 1944: 110, color repro. and cover.
1944	Frankfurter, Alfred. "French Masterpieces for the National Gallery." <i>Art News</i> 42, no. 10 (August 1944): 10, 24, repro.
1944	Frankfurter, Alfred M. <i>The Kress Collection in the National Gallery</i> . New York, 1944: 78, no. 73, color repro.
1944	"Kress Makes Important Donation of French Painting to the Nation." <i>Art Digest</i> 18, no. 19 (1 August 1944): 5, repro.
1944	"One of the Greatest Donations of XVIIIth Century French Painting Ever Received by a Museum - The Kress Collection." <i>Illustrated London News</i> 115, no. 2992 (26 August 1944): 249, repro.
1944	"The Almanac: French Paintings Given to the National Gallery." <i>The Magazine Antiques</i> 46, no. 5 (November 1944): 288.
1945	Paintings and Sculpture from the Kress Collection. National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1945 (reprinted 1947, 1949): 158, repro.
1946	Favorite Paintings from the National Gallery of Art Washington, D.C New York, 1946: 51-54, color repro.
1948	Wildenstein and Company. <i>French XVIII Century Paintings</i> . New York, 1948: 4.
1950	Adhémar, Hélène and René Huyghe. <i>Watteau, sa vie, son oeuvre</i> . Paris, 1950:231, no. 211, repro. pl. 146.
1952	Panofsky, Dora. "Gilles or Pierrot? Iconographic Notes on Watteau."  Gazette des Beaux-Arts ser. 6, 39 (May 1952): 333-340, repro. fig. 9.
1956	Einstein, Lewis. "Looking at French Eighteenth Century Pictures in Washington." <i>Gazette des Beaux-Arts</i> 6th ser., 47, no. 1048-1049 (May-June 1956): 217, repro fig. 3, 218, 220-221.
1956	Walker, John. <i>National Gallery of Art, Washington</i> . New York, 1956: 46, repro.
1959	Cooke, Hereward Lester. French Paintings of the 16th-18th Centuries in the National Gallery of Art. Washington, D.C., 1959 (Booklet Number Four in Ten Schools of Painting in the National Gallery of Art,
	Washington, D.C.): 26, color repro.
1959	Paintings and Sculpture from the Samuel H. Kress Collection. National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1959: 350, repro.
1961	Mirimonde, Albert Pomme de. "Les sujets musicaux chez Antoine Watteau." <i>Gazette des Beaux-Arts</i> ser. 6, 58 (November 1961): 272-276,

The Italian Comedians 18

283, fig. 27.

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

- 1963 Walker, John. National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C. New York, 1963 (reprinted 1964 in French, German, and Spanish): 208, repro. 1965 Summary Catalogue of European Paintings and Sculpture. National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1965: 139. 1966 Cairns, Huntington, and John Walker, eds. A Pageant of Painting from the National Gallery of Art. 2 vols. New York, 1966: 2:302, color repro. Brookner, Anita. Watteau. Feltham, 1967: 8, 17, 18, 23, 40, repro. pl. 46. 1967 1968 Gandolfo, Giampaolo et al. National Gallery of Art, Washington. Great Museums of the World. New York, 1968: 68-69, color repro. 1968 National Gallery of Art. European Paintings and Sculpture, Illustrations. Washington, 1968: 126, repro. European Paintings: An Illustrated Summary Catalogue. National Gallery 1975 of Art, Washington, 1975: 374, repro. 1977 Eisler, Colin. Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection: European Schools Excluding Italian. Oxford, 1977: 300-306, figs. 267-269. 1977 Pope-Hennessy, John. "Completing the Account." Review of Colin Eisler, Paintings from the Samuel H. Kress Collection, London 1977. Times Literary Supplement no. 3927 (17 June 1977). 1977 Raines, Robert. "Watteau and 'Watteaus' in England before 1760." Gazette des Beaux-Artsser. 6, no 51 (February 1977): 57, 62, no. 53. 1978 Chan, Victor. "Watteau's 'Les Comédians Italiens' Once More." Revue d'art canadien/Canadian Art Review 5, no. 2 (1978-1979): 107-112. 1978 King, Marian. Adventures in Art: National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C. New York, 1978: 66, pl. 38. Bryson, Norman. Word and Image: French Painting of the Ancien 1981 Regime. Cambridge, 1981: 77-79, repro. fig. 28. Sutton, Denys. "Aspects of British Collecting Part 1:IV: The Age of 1981 Robert Walpole." Apollo 114, no. 237 (November 1981): 329-330, 338 n. 9, repro. fig. 6. Tomlinson, Robert. La fête gallante: Watteau et Marivaux. Geneva, 1981: 1981 12 n. 18, repro. fig. 3b. 1982 Eighteenth-Century Drawings from the Collection of Mrs. Gertrude Laughlin Chanler. Exh. cat. National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1982: 60-61, repro. fig. 20.
- Rosenberg, Pierre and Ettore Camesasca Tout l'oeuvre peint de 1982 Watteau. Paris, 1982: 121, no. 203, repro.
- 1983 Posner, Donald. Another Look at Watteau's Gilles. Apollo 117 (February 1983): 97-99, repro. fig. 2, as After Watteau.
- 1984 Posner, Donald. Antoine Watteau. Ithaca, 1984: 120, 263-269, 291 n 62-64, repro. fig. 192, as After Watteau.
- 1984 Roland Michel, Marianne. Watteau. Un artiste au XVIIIe siècle. Paris and London, 1984: 64, 109, 177, repro. pl. 11.
- Walker, John. National Gallery of Art, Washington. Rev. ed. New York, 1984 1984: 330, no. 438, color repro.

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

- 1985 European Paintings: An Illustrated Catalogue. National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1985: 434, repro.
- 1987 Grasselli, Margaret Morgan. "The Drawings of Antoine Watteau: stylistic development and problems of chronology." 3 vols. Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, Cambridge, 1987: 2:390-395; 542-545, no. 289-293; 3:repro. fig. 468.
- 1987 Roland Michel, Marianne. "Watteau et les 'Figures de différents caractères'" in Antoine Watteau (1684 - 1721) The Painter, His Age, and His Legend. Paris, 1987: 40, 273, repro. 67
- 1992 National Gallery of Art, Washington. National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1992: 166, repro.
- 1992 Vidal, Mary. Watteau's Painted Conversations: Art, Literature, and Talk in Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century France. New Haven and London, 1992: 41, 134, 146-147, repro. pl. 144.
- 1997 Banu, Georges. Le Rideau ou la fêlure du monde, Paris, 1997, p. 137, repro.
- 1998 Shefer, Elaine. "Masks/Personae." In Encyclopedia of Comparative Iconography: Themes Depicted in Works of Art, edited by Helene E. Roberts. 2 vols. Chicago, 1998: 2:581.
- 1999 Heck, Thomas F. Picturing Performance: The Iconography of the Performing Arts in Concept and Practice. Rochester, 1999: 2-5, repro. fig
- 1999 Jarrassé, Dominique. 18th-Century French Painting. Paris, 1999: 60, repro.
- 2000 Börsch-Supan, Helmut. Antoine Watteau 1684-1721. Trans. Anthea Bell. Cologne, 2000: 53-54, 62, 52, repro., as by Unknown Copyist after Watteau.
- 2003 Bryant, Julius. Kenwood: Paintings in the Iveagh Bequest. New Haven and London, 2003: 15, 16 fig. 21, 416.
- 2003 Hanson, Craig. "Dr. Richard Mead and Watteau's 'Comédiens italiens'." Apollo CXLV, no. 1201 (April 2003): 265+, repro.
- Hand, John Oliver. National Gallery of Art: Master Paintings from the 2004 Collection. Washington and New York, 2004: 232-233, 262-263, no. 214, color repro.
- 2005 Baillio, Joseph, et al. The Arts of France from François Ier to Napoléon ler. A Centennial Celebration of Wildenstein's Presence in New York. Exh. cat. Wildenstein & Co., Inc., New York, 2005: 78 (not in the exhibition).
- Conisbee, Philip, et al. French Paintings of the Fifteenth through the 2009 Eighteenth Century. The Collections of the National Gallery of Art Systematic Catalogue. Washington, D.C., 2009: no. 99, 472-479, color
- 2009 Grasselli, Margaret Morgan. Renaissance to Revolution: French Drawings from the National Gallery of Art, 1500-1800. Exh. cat. National

French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries

Gallery of Art, Washington, 2009: 102, repro. fig. 1. 2016 Sund, Judy. "Why So Sad? Watteau's Pierrots." Art Bulletin 98, no. 3 (September 2016): 322-323, 325, color fig. 4, 341 n. 16.

To cite: Philip Conisbee, Aaron Wile, "Antoine Watteau/The Italian Comedians/probably 1720," French Paintings of the Fifteenth through Eighteenth Centuries, NGA Online Editions, https://purl.org/nga/collection/artobject/32687 (accessed May 20, 2024).